



STATE OF NEW JERSEY

**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION
OF THE
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION**

In the Matter of Christian Govan,
Fire Fighter (M2211D), City of
Camden

CSC Docket No. 2024-1771

List Removal Appeal

ISSUED: September 25, 2024 (KMG)

Christian Govan, represented by Stuart J. Alterman, Esq., appeals the removal of his name on the Firefighter (M2211D), City of Camden (Camden), eligible list due to his failure to meet the residency requirement.

The appellant, a non-veteran, took and passed the open competitive examination for Firefighter (M2211D), which had a closing date of August 31, 2022 and was open to residents of Camden. The subject eligible list promulgated on April 28, 2023 and expires on April 27, 2025. The appellant's name was certified to the appointing authority as the 47th listed eligible on the June 29, 2023 certification (OL230838). In disposing of the certification, the appointing authority requested the appellant's removals. In particular, it claimed that based on the appellant's 2022 tax returns and W-2, it was determined that he had failed to meet the residency requirement.

On appeal to the Civil Service Commission (Commission), the appellant proffers that he has resided continuously in Camden since August 31, 2022. In support, the appellant submits a confirmation from the Motor Vehicle Commission, that the appellant updated his address to Camden, effective August 31, 2022. Additionally, the appellant submits, in relevant part, an undated PSE&G mailing to the Camden address; the appellant's Pre-Employment Questionnaire, dated October 2023, indicating that he resided in Camden from September 2021 through the present; and an October 2023 New Jersey American Water Homeowner Water Line and Sewer Line Protection Program advertisement,¹ sent to a Camden address. The

¹ In his certification, the appellant claims this is a bill. However, the document states, under "Program Status," that the address is not protected by the program, and that the "Offer expires 10/31/2023."

appellant also claims that the appointing authority relied on documents that contained clerical errors. In particular, he maintains that his W-2 from Millenium Account Services, listed an incorrect Clayton street number, which he claims never occurred to him to have corrected. In support, he also submits a letter from Nolan James Financial Services stating that the appellant's address on his 2022 Income Tax was incorrect and it should have been a Camden address. Therefore, the appellant argues that he has clearly shown that he lives in the address in question and he has "begun establishing roots" in Camden.

Despite an opportunity to do so, Camden has not submitted a response in this matter.

CONCLUSION

N.J.A.C. 4A:4-4.2.11(c) provides that where residence requirements have been established in local service in addition to the New Jersey State residency requirement, residence with regard to local service requirements means a single residence. The following standards shall be used in determining local legal residence:

1. Whether the locations in question are owned or rented.
2. Whether time actually spent in the claimed residence exceeds that of other locations.
3. Whether the relationship among those persons living in the claimed residence is closer than those whom the individual lives elsewhere. If an individual claims a parent's residence because of separation from his or her spouse or domestic partner, a court order or other evidence of separation may be requested;
4. Whether, if the residence requirement of the anticipated or actual appointment was eliminated, the individual would be likely to remain in the claimed residence;
5. Whether the residence recorded on a driver's license, motor vehicle registration, or voter registration card and other documents in the same as the claimed legal residence. Post office box number shall not be acceptable; and
6. Whether the school district attended by child(ren) living with the individual is the same as the claimed residence.

N.J.A.C. 4A:4-2.11(e)1 states that unless otherwise specified, residency requirements shall be met by the announced closing date for the examination. When an appoint authority requires residency as of the date of appointment, residency must be continuously maintained from the closing date up to and including the date of appointment. Additionally, *N.J.A.C. 4A:4-6.3(b)* in conjunction with *N.J.A.C. 4A:4-4.7(d)* provides that the appellant has the burden of proof to show by a preponderance of the evidence that an appointing authority's decision to remove his or her name from an eligible list was in error.


In the instant matter, the appellant has certified on appeal that his residence has been continuous in Camden since the August 31, 2022 closing date of the examination to present. The appellant's "Motor Vehicle Services Address Change History" indicates that he changed his address on the August 31, 2022 closing date. Moreover, the appellant provides a credible explanation as to why his tax returns and W-2 have a Clayton address. Pursuant to the standards set forth in *N.J.A.C. 4A:4-2.11(c)*, the appellant has presented convincing evidence that he resides in Camden and that he has done so since the closing date. Accordingly, the appellant has met his burden of proof in this matter and the appointing authority has failed to present a sufficient basis to remove the appellant's name from the eligible list for Firefighter (M2211D), Camden, eligible list.

ORDER

Therefore, it is ordered that this appeal be granted, and the appellant's name be restored to the Firefighter (M2211D), Camden, eligible list, for prospective employment opportunities only.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in a judicial forum.

DECISION RENDERED BY THE
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON
THE 25TH DAY OF SEPTEMBER, 2024



Allison Chris Myers
Chairperson
Civil Service Commission

Inquiries
and
Correspondence

Nicholas Angiulo
Director
Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs
Civil Service Commission
Written Record Appeals Unit
P.O. Box 312
Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312

c: Christian Govan
Stuart J. Alterman, Esq.
Timothy Cunningham
Division of Human Resource Information Services